Minutes of Regular Public Meeting
February 9, 2017

Mrs. Susan Benjamin presided over the PESD No. 1 Governing Board Meeting in the Governing Board room at Emerson Court, 1817 N. Seventh Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85006

Other Board Members present were:
Dr. Ruth Ann Marston  Dr. Louisa Stark  Ms. Lynne Almy  Mr. Daniil Gunitskiy

Also present were:
Mr. Larry Weeks  Mr. Tom Lind  Dr. Rosanna Hidalgo  Jovanny Cervantes
Chief Executive Officer  Assistant Superintendent  Assistant Superintendent  Board Secretary

A. Regular Session - 6:00 p.m.

1. Call to Order – Mrs. Susan Benjamin

Meeting called to order at 6:01pm

2. Pledge of Allegiance- Meleika Wadley

Ms. Meleika Wadley led us in the pledge of allegiance

3. Awards and Recognitions

Mr. Weeks congratulated the STAR Award Winners who were recognized.

- Troy Harris, Emerson Court - MIS, Technology Coordinator
- Priscilla Yazzie, Bethune School, Instructional Assistant
- Michaela Chatman, Bethune School, 5th & 6th Grade ELA Teacher

Mr. Weeks share a few words as to why they were nominated.

Mr. Lind announced who were the District Spelling Bee Winners.

- 1st place: Jayleen Lopez, 6th grade, Shaw Montessori
- 2nd place: Layla Torres, 6th grade, Shaw Montessori
- 3rd place: Amelia Reyes, 6th grade, Kenilworth
B. Approval of Consent Agenda

1. Request Approval of Governing Board Minutes for January 12, 2017 and January 26, 2017

2. Request for Governing Board to Approve Out of State Travel

3. Request Approval for Out of District Field Trips

4. Request Approval or Ratification of Payroll $4,227,569.11 and Expense Vouchers $2,979,348.13 in the total amount of $7,206,917.24

5. Request Approval or Ratification of Employment of Administrative, Certified and Support Staff

6. Request Approval or Ratification of Employee Contract/Work Agreement Adjustments for Changes in Position

7. Request Approval of Separation of Employment, Resignations and Retirements

8. Request Approval of Uncompensated Leave of Absences

9. Request for Approval of Non-Renewal of Retired Teachers who are Working in the District as Retirees

10. Request Approval of Issuing Professional Staff Contracts and Special Support Services Contracts for the 2017-2018 School Year

11. Request Approval of Consent Agenda

Motion by Daniil Gunitskiy, second by Louisa Stark. Final Resolution: Motion Carries

Yea.: Ruth Ann Marston, Susan Benjamin, Lynné Almy, Louisa Stark, Daniil Gunitskiy

C. Chief Executive Officer's Report - Larry Weeks

1. Announcements

Mr. Weeks updated the Governing Board on Senate Bills underway.

2. Request Approval to Receive and Discuss a Potential Revision to Policy BDB: Board Officers

D. Community Communications

1. Community Communications

Mr. Perry Young came before the Governing Board to present Mr. Weeks with a gift to thank him for his visit to their campus.
Mr. Young also Welcome Ms. Lynné Almy to the board.

E. Curriculum & Instruction - Tom Lind, Assistant Superintendent

1. Receive and Discuss the 2016 National Summit for Courageous Conversation Conference

2016 National Conference for Courageous Conversation was Presentation by Meleika Wadley, Diane Wray and Susan Benjamin. The presentation is available for you at this link: http://phxschools.org/employee/webdocuments/GBUpdates/Phx_El_GB_Mtg_020917_Equity_Presentation.pptx

Mrs. Wadley shared the Journey to Courageous Conversations.

*February 19th 2016 Arizona School Social Work Association Annual Conference “Kyrene’s Journey to Equity”

*March 31st 2016 Site Visit: Kyrene School District Equity Journey (Meleika Wadley, Tom Lind, and Diane Wray)

*July 26th 2016 MTSS Training, Keynote: Cultural Matters in Teaching and Learning. Workshop: Learning and Integrating Relevant Pedagogy to MTSS Model

*September 23rd – 27th 2016 National Summit for Courageous Conversation Conference in Austin, Texas “Reflections of Our Better Selves”

Mrs. Wadley stated, what is Courageous Conversations? Mrs. Wadley continued to say that, Derived from the book Courageous Conversations about Race by Glenn Singleton. The book discusses the impact of culture and race on education and provides a field guide for achieving educational equity in schools. The Courageous Conversations Conference challenges educators to think critically about intersectionality between culture, race and the achievement gap.

Mrs. Wadley and Diane Wray spoke about Educational Equity/Achievement Gap and also shared about the District Achievement (ELA) Data by Ethnicity/Race and District Achievement (Math) Data by Ethnicity/Race.

Mrs. Diane Wray shared her departments Critical Reflections
Mrs. Wray informed the Governing Board about the Myth about the Achievement Gap—Poverty has been cited as the sole reason for school failure. ("Students who are poor have lower test scores because they lack resources") The past 25 years of research suggest there are also institutional reasons for the achievement gap.

- **Cultural Mismatch**—A cultural mismatch is characterized as a situation where a student's home culture is in contrast with the dominant culture of the classroom or teacher. Cultural mismatches can exacerbate many academic issues and classroom management problems.

- **Cultural Deficit View**—The belief that students who are failing in school is because parents and students have internal deficits (language, poverty, parents don’t value education). This belief leads to low expectations and lack of opportunities.
- **Colorblindness**— Disregard of racial characteristics, “I don’t see color. I treat all my students the same,” denies the reality of students’ identity and experiences.

Mrs. Wadley, Mrs. Wray and Mrs. Susan Benjamin shared Recommendations for Building Capacity and Awareness

- Hosting webinar series from Teaching Tolerance on “Equity Matters” and monthly meetings dedicated to cultural competency social work standards
- Collaborating and sharing resources with educational equity experts
- Board Resolution - direction regarding the specific action we will now take in order to breathe life into this commitment and ensure that is universally visible and embedded throughout our district culture
- Training to build awareness for Governing Board, Cabinet, and District leadership team
- Culturally Responsive Teaching Strategies Training for teachers and support staff
- Integrate educational equity in the strategic plan
- District Equity Team/Committee

Attend Arizona Board Association Equity conference on April 5th - 7th / Presidents Equity Challenge

Mrs. Wray asked the Governing Board Will You Accept the #Equity Challenge?

Mrs. Wray stated that The President’s (Julie Bacon) Equity Challenge campaign was created and launched by the Arizona School Boards Association as the annual theme to kick off 2017. The intent of the campaign is to encourage individual school board members and school districts to take a look at students on a deeper level—to find out who they really are and how we can best serve them by identifying equity gaps to better serve EVERY child in every school district across Arizona.

Mrs. Benjamin shared her thought about the Call to Action/Next Steps for the Governing Board.

Mrs. Benjamin stated:

“A strong equity focus supported by a thoughtful, deliberate and strategic board policy increases a board’s chance to sustain an equity-based agenda. When policies and monitoring systems are aligned, it is much more likely that policies, practices and expectations become more deeply embedded as governance tools to promote and sustain equity commitments in our school district.” - Susan Benjamin

Ms. Gail LaGrander shared a statement about Item E.1

Statement attached:

Governing Board Meeting
February 9, 2017

Good evening, Ms. Benjamin, Governing Board members, and Cabinet:
I am here this evening to express my support for the proposed action steps that would move us in the direction of the goal of educational equity. Thank you, Meleika and team.

I remain grateful to the Governing Board for having afforded me the opportunity on two occasions to attend the National Family and Community Engagement conference. I am pleased to report that educational equity is woven throughout all aspects of this conference. Along with teachers, administrators, and other support staff, family engagement practitioners are focused on academic success for all students. Where we specialize is in the building of genuine, respectful partnerships between the school and the home in support of student learning. We view parents and families as their child’s first teacher and as lifelong advocates of their child’s wellbeing and success.

As the district’s Parent and Family Engagement Coordinator, I consider it to be of special importance that I comment on the content in the “Critical Reflections” slide, which addresses some of the myths that perpetuate the achievement and opportunity gap, including erroneous assumptions about parents and families of color. It is imperative that all of us at Phoenix El build our capacity to engage and partner with families through:

1. Learning opportunities that deepen our understanding of the diverse cultures and lives of our families, leading us to a practice that is more culturally relevant and responsive
2. Greater recognition of the existing strengths and assets of families, who are strong, capable, and competent experts on their children
3. Embracing families as full and equal partners in reaching our shared goal of academic success for all students

I applauded you on December 8 for the passage of the Governing Board Resolution – Declaration of Principles. I am here this evening to ask for your leadership in taking the next step. We must wrestle with the harsh realities embedded in the data that was presented this evening. These are OUR children, and we must move with urgency to make educational equity a part of everything we do.

I would like to close with a quotation from James Baldwin, a Black American novelist, essayist, playwright, poet, and social and political activist. (1924-1987)

“Not everything that is faced can be changed, but nothing can be changed until it is faced.”

Thank you-

The Governing Board thanked Ms. Gail LaGrander, Meleika Wadley, Diane Wray and Susan Benjamin for coming before the Governing Board tonight.

F. Business Services - Dr. Rosanna Hidalgo, Assistant Superintendent

1. Request Approval for Issuance of Purchase Order to Creative Communications (Az State Contract ADSPO13-036883) for Professional Portable Two-Way Radio Internet Protocol Site Connect System
Mr. Parra and Mr. Foster came before the Governing Board to provide a presentation about the possible purchase of professional portable two-way radios from Creative Communications that would be used for numerous roles and at our campuses.

Mr. Foster and Mr. Parra shared the three-year process which led to the selection of this professional portable two-way radios.

Motion by Ruth Ann Marston, second by Louisa Stark.
Final Resolution: Motion Carries
Yea:, Ruth Ann Marston, Susan Benjamin, Lynné Almy, Louisa Stark, Daniil Gunitskiy

G. Board Reports and Requests

1. Board Reports and Requests

The Governing Board asked to schedule a meeting to consider a resolution opposing Senate Bill 1174.

Dr. Marston informed everyone about the passing of The Honorable Judge Earl Carroll who passed away last week. He served on our District Governing Board for 16yrs.

Attachment to Item G.1
Hon. Earl H. Carroll

1925 - 2017 Obituary Condolences

Hon. Earl H. Carroll

The family of United States District Judge Earl H. Carroll is very sad to announce his passing on February 3, 2017. Born in Tucson on March 26, 1925 to parents John and Ruby Carroll, Earl Carroll lived a very full life of 91 years, including more than 30 years as a federal judge. He spent his early years near Wickenburg, on a gold mine called the Silver Flag. His lifelong appreciation for public education began on that remote mine site, with live-in teachers sent by the state to educate rural students such as Earl and his older brother, John. Later in life, Earl was known to quote long passages of poetry, such as The Charge of the Light Brigade, along
with wise (or witty) sayings in Latin. He also developed an early appreciation for a good
dictionary. Earl continued his education in Tucson and Phoenix, graduating from Phoenix Union
High School, where he first met Louise Rowlands, who became his beloved wife in 1952.

Earl Carroll enlisted in the United States Navy in 1943, and was part of the Navy's V-12 officer
training program, providing him cherished opportunities to study at Arizona State Teacher's
College in Flagstaff (now Northern Arizona University), UCLA, and Harvard. He served as an
ensign in the Navy from 1943 to 1946, with service in the Pacific. After the Navy, he completed a
business degree at the University of Arizona (1948), where he also earned his law degree (1951),
grading second in his class.

He began his legal career clerking for The Honorable Evo DeConcini of the Arizona Supreme
Court. He joined the law firm of Evans, Hull, Kitchel and Jenkies in 1952, becoming a partner
in 1955 with special expertise in public utility, transportation and mining law. During his time in
private practice, Earl also served as counsel for the city of Tombstone. In 1980, Earl Carroll
was nominated to the federal district court in Phoenix by President Jimmy Carter. Taking senior
status in 1994 opened a position to be filled by The Honorable Roselyn Silver, although Judge
Carroll continued to be active on the court until his retirement in 2011.

Among the highlights of Judge Carroll's life were his service on the Arizona Board of Regents
(1978-1980) and his role in presiding over naturalization ceremonies for new U.S. citizens and
challenging cases such as "The Sanctuary Trial" and the long-running Navajo-Hopi dispute.
Judge Carroll believed in fidelity to the rule of law, tempered with compassion for individuals.
Chief Justice William H. Rehnquist appointed Judge Carroll to the United States Foreign
Intelligence Surveillance Court in 1993 and he was named chief judge of the federal Alien
Terrorist Removal Court in 1996.

He regularly supported educational programs for Arizona's universities, including co-
establishing a public service scholarship for law students with his long-time friend, Tucson
attorney Thomas Chandler, at the University of Arizona College of Law. His public service
included election to the Phoenix Elementary School Board, serving for 12 years, as well as
support for U of A's College of Social & Behavioral Sciences, Red Cross, Camp Fire Girls, the
Valley of the Sun YMCA, Chapel Rock - the AZ Church Conference Center, and his college
fraternity, Sigma Chi.

Judge Carroll is survived by his wife of 64 years, Louise, and his daughters, Margaret Carroll
and Katherine C. Pearson. His daughters continue their parents' deep commitment to education,
public service and respect for justice. Judge Carroll's extended legal family includes his
colleagues on the bench, his talented court staff, and dozens of "assistant judges," his law clerks
and interns, selected from law schools across the county, including U of A, Arizona State
University, Penn State's Dickinson Law, and Harvard. Judge Carroll's entire family is especially
grateful for the thoughtful care provided by Huger Mercy Living Center and Hospice of the
Valley.

One of Judge Carroll's favorite lines of poetry, by Robert Browning: "Ah, but a man's reach
should exceed his grasp, Or what's a heaven for?"
Contributions in lieu of flowers can be made to the Carroll-Chandler Public Service Fund at U of A College of Law (Law-Alumni/Development, 1201 E. Speedway, Tucson AZ 85721 or [www.law.arizona.edu/give](http://www.law.arizona.edu/give)), or to educational institutions of the donor’s choice. A private graveside service at the Arizona National Veteran's Cemetery will be followed by a Memorial Service in mid-March, with details to be available through Whitney & Murphy Funeral Home. Published in The Arizona Republic from Feb. 9 to Feb. 12, 2017


Dr. Hidalgo relayed a message from Ms. Rosalinda Ramirez who thanked the Governing Board for considering the early approval of teacher contracts. Dr. Hidalgo announced that a $1000 base increase to the salary was included to increase the starting salary for all new hires.

2. Future Agenda Items

*Mrs. Benjamin asked for a study session to be scheduled to receive, discuss and take possible action on medical and dental providers.*

H. Adjournment

1. Adjournment

*Meeting adjourned at 7:47pm.*

Respectfully Submitted by

Mrs. Susán Benjamin
Board President, Phoenix Elementary School District #1